

Greater Pine Island Study  
Facts and Comparisons  
To the Greg Stuart Briefing Book  
Presented to the MCA

BJM Consulting, Inc.

# Revenue Comparisons

Municipality	Area Sq.Mi.	2017 Population	Density/Sq.Mi.	2017 General Fund Revenues	Revenues Per Capita
Bonita Springs	40.5	47,727	1178	\$ 17,469,378	\$ 366.03
Greater Pine Island	43	9,200	214	\$ 4,251,448	\$ 462.11
Estero	25.1	31,322	1248	\$ 11,131,000	\$ 355.37
Fort Myers Beach	2.6	7,085	2725	\$ 4,100,780	\$ 578.80

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- Greater Pine Island will be Lee County's 2<sup>nd</sup> largest city at 43 Square miles. **TRUE**
- The proposed new city will have the lowest population density in Lee County. **TRUE**
- The State requires a density of 1.5 persons per acre; GPI density is .33 person per acre. **TRUE, but when you remove the conservation and agriculture areas the density per acre is 1.22 persons per acre**
- Greater Pine Island will have the lowest Ad Valorem tax revenue per person within Lee County, at \$462.11 per person. **FALSE, the MCA study used General Fund revenues not Ad Valorem, they used 2010 populations for all other cities except GPI and the amount is not the lowest.**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** A 43 sq. mile city with a low population and low tax revenues will inevitably lead to tax increases, which will drive out the average homeowner & change community character for the worse. **This is not fact but just one opinion as a possible outcome**
- **FINDINGS:** The GPI incorporation effort does not meet state population density requirements that were put in place to insure economic viability and financially sustainable over time. – **True, but waivers have been granted to the State density requirements as recent as last session.**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** 66.1% of the proposed new city will consist of Conservation and Agriculture lands; with relatively no commercial tax base to fall back on, residential parcels will ultimately be subject to high levels of future tax increases to support municipal services & public works needed for a 43 square mile city. **First Statement is TRUE, but the expectation of increase taxes due solely to size is FALSE; conservation and agricultural areas do not require many municipal service or public work expenditures.**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Excluding infrastructure damage, Hurricane Irma impacted Lee County by \$742,051,532.
- **FINDINGS:** The City of Islamorada budgets \$3MM for emergency reserves, including temporary shelter; Sanibel sets aside \$3.7MM.
- **FINDINGS:** The GPI Incorporation Study does not address natural disaster impacts, budgetary requirements and reserves. In so doing the GPI Incorporation Study is financially and conceptually flawed.
- **The first two Finding are TRUE, but the last is FALSE as the study does not eliminate the Greater Pine Island Community from the Lee County All Hazards MSTU. Therefor the area would remain under Lee County for much of the disaster response cost.**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Pine Island is at the forefront of areas that are the first to suffer from long term climate change --- more severe tropical storms and storm surges leading to mangrove forest losses, water quality degradation, increased coastal erosion, continuous sea level rise, and increasing strains upon and costs in infrastructure due to salinity increase and flooding. **TRUE, but these issues will need to be dealt with by whomever provides local government services.**
- **FINDINGS:** Excluding Pine Island Rd. and Stringfellow Rd., a new Pine Island City is financially responsible for repairing and rebuilding miles of local streets and drainage systems needed in response to climate change. The GPI Incorporation Study ignores this fact -- its economic findings are not accurate. **FALSE, the study does not recommend the new city share in the local gas tax and therefor the maintenance of local roads and adjoining drainage will remain the responsibility of Lee County**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Pine Island has 100's of miles of local streets and open drainage swales. The GPI Incorporation study ignores real infrastructure and public works maintenance, repair and rebuilding costs. **Somewhat TRUE, the study does not address any capital cost but includes present level of maintenance cost to continue through Lee County**
- **FINDINGS:** The GPI study does not differentiate Pine Island's infrastructure needs and deficits with the comparative absence of infrastructure needs for Matlacha and Matlacha Isles. These two communities will become donor communities to fund Pine Island infrastructure deficits. **Depending on the funding source use for the improvements this could be TRUE**
- **FINDINGS:** The GPI does not provide for realistic public works budgets and reserves. The GPI study is highly inaccurate. **FALSE the study presents a status quo level of service for the initial 5 years.**



# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Residential properties will make up 90% of GPI tax base whereas the Commercial tax base is 8%. **TRUE**
- **FINDINGS:** The GPI Incorporation Study -- \$1.98MM in revenues, \$1.04MM in expenditures and a potential surplus of \$0.937K; a real budget with roads, drainage, environmental & economic projects, disaster & human services, and debt service would show an annual deficit. **False, this is one possible outcome based on new service levels being adopted by the local elected officials.**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Matlacha's character is in part due to its commercial strip that consists of local, "mom and pop" businesses that operate seasonally on very thin margins. **TRUE**
- **FINDINGS:** Acknowledging a new GPI city's very limited tax base, over time commercial properties will be taxed first and taxed hard to meet real budgetary requirements. This will be so due to political reasons; i.e., homeowners are the majority and commercial owners the minority. **False, Florida law requires all property to be taxed equally by paying the same millage.**
- **FINDINGS:** It is easily conceivable that even moderate tax increases to the property owner will be passed along as unaffordable rent increases. Over time a viable Matlacha commercial strip will be lost. **Opinion**

# Response to Findings in MCA Briefing Book

- **FINDINGS:** Matlacha is a completely built-out, small SF lot linked islands with central water, sewer and paved roads. The issues facing Matlacha are completely different than Pine Island build out issues. **TRUE**
- **FINDINGS:** Pine Island consists of 1,000's of parcels of which 3,839 (4,100 acres) are vacant; average lot size is 1 acre +. Pine Island has 1,000's of acres of platted lands without central sewer and an undetermined amount of unpaved roads. Pine Island is 32 sq. mi., has an approximately population of 8,523 and a density of 266 persons per sq. mi. **TRUE**
- **FINDINGS:** From providing infrastructure and services, to coastal erosion and drainage maintenance, Pine Island has numerous costly deficits that will ultimately be paid by Matlacha and Matlacha Isles tax dollars. **Depending on the revenue associated with the projects this might be TRUE**